Sorry...you just don’t fit into our culture: Unconscious Bias in Hiring Decisions

Beth Crist
Youth Services

Jean Marie Heilig
Fiscal Officer
“If you have a brain you’re biased”

-Dr. Heidi Grant
NeuroLeadership Institute
Bias

- Explicit
- Implicit / Unconscious
WHERE DO THESE BIASES COME FROM?

Direct Experiences
(with other people, events, situations)

Vicarious Experiences
(those relayed to us through other people, stories, books, movies, media and culture)
LIBRARY WORKERS: FACTS AND FIGURES
ADDRESSING THE ELEPHANT IN THE ROOM

Female 79%
Male 21%

White, non-Hispanic: 77.0%

Hispanic or Latino: 8.6%

Black or African American: 6.8%

Asian-American or Pacific Islander: 4.6%

Library Professionals Mean Annual Earnings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Librarians</td>
<td>$59,795</td>
<td>$51,715</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library Technicians</td>
<td>$38,676</td>
<td>$30,874</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library Assistants</td>
<td>$31,665</td>
<td>$27,740</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

What biases can affect the hiring process?
UNCONSCIOUS BIAS BEHAVIORS

Gender Bias

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=7nJq6des4jg
UNCONSCIOUS BIAS BEHAVIORS

Confirmation Bias
UNCONSCIOUS BIAS BEHAVIORS

Beauty Bias
UNCONSCIOUS BIAS BEHAVIORS

Halo Effect
Unconscious Bias Behaviors

Horns Effect
Unconscious Bias Behaviors

Leniency Bias
Unconscious Bias Behaviors

Strictness or Stringent Bias
UNCONSCIOUS BIAS BEHAVIORS

Compare and Contrast Effect
UNCONSCIOUS BIAS BEHAVIORS

Personal Similarity Bias or Affinity Bias
UNCONSCIOUS BIAS BEHAVIORS

Conformity Bias
RECRUITMENT: REASSESS NEEDS

- What are the critical outcomes of the position?
- Are “traditional” experience and education requirements necessary?
- What skills can be learned on the job?
JOB DESCRIPTIONS

- Focus on essential skills and outcomes required over specific experience and education
- Avoid jargon/abbreviations
- Use inclusive, neutral language

Youth Services Librarian
Douglas County Libraries

Job Description
Douglas County Libraries elevates our community by inspiring a love of reading, discovery and connection.

Douglas County Libraries is currently seeking an energetic and highly motivated individual to join DCL as a Youth Services Librarian, at our Castle Rock Library. The Youth Services Librarian, performs a variety of patron contact duties - in person, on the phone, and online. In addition to an understanding of the principles and practices related to public library work, there is a passion for creating an outstanding library experience for DCL’s library patrons. The Librarian position is responsible for planning, coordinating and implementing Storytimes, library services and events within the library and infusing these experiences with magic and memories for our community. This position leads, inspires and supports the DCL mission and core values. Work is performed with independent judgment and initiative.

Additional Info & Requirements

ESSENTIAL FUNCTIONS
1. Create premium experiences for patrons through effective and efficient completion of duties; serve as professional, positive representative of DCL in attitude, appearance and communications.
2. Support DCL core values, code of ethics, policies and procedures and strategic initiatives at all times; integrate related activities.
# Job Descriptions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Masculine Terms</th>
<th>Feminine Terms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Confident</td>
<td>Cooperative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Driven</td>
<td>Supportive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rock Star</td>
<td>Dependable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ninja</td>
<td>Collaborative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leader</td>
<td>Interpersonal Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decisive</td>
<td>Honest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adventurous</td>
<td>Understanding</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Job Description Activity
**Job Postings**

- Advertise within **and** beyond traditional library job outlets
- Ask community partners to advertise openings
- Assign a contact(s) who can provide assistance during the application process
- Provide as long an application period as possible
APPLICATION/RESUME REVIEW

Hiring Bias – Diversity & Inclusion Dramas

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MRASZPQDPv0
APPLICATION/RESUME REVIEW

“Going Blind”
APPLICATION/RESUME REVIEW

“Going Blind”

- Names

Latisha and Jamal

vs

Valentina and Carlos

vs

Emily and Greg
APPLICATION/RESUME REVIEW

“Going Blind”

- Addresses
APPLICATION/RESUME REVIEW

“Going Blind”
- Schools / Graduation Dates
APPLICATION/RESUME REVIEW

“Going Blind”
- Social Media Profile Pictures
Scheduling Interviews

- Offer varied interview times
- Offer a remote interview option
- Consider phone interviews
- Provide one contact
- Clearly communicate the hiring process verbally and in writing
**Interview Panel**

- 3 - 4 interviewers from diverse backgrounds
- Awareness of personal biases
- Discuss with the panel how to avoid bias during interviews
- Avoid discussing candidates between interviews
**STANDARDIZE INTERVIEWS**

- Ask each applicant the same questions
- Stick to the script
- Create a rubric for scoring each candidate
- Include “likeability” on the rubric
- Rate candidates separately before discussing as a group
Interview Questions

- Ask specific, behavioral questions
- Check for bias
- Focus on skills and knowledge over specific experience and education
- Questions need to be clear and concise while avoiding jargon and abbreviations
**Skills Test**

- Ask candidate to perform a skill or produce an outcome that will be needed for the job

---

**Librarian Extraordinaire Search**

**Sunday**
- 6:00pm: Dinner with Search Committee member, Faculty Librarian colleague and Associate Director A
- 7:30pm: Library and Campus Tour

**Monday**
- 8:15am: Meet with AD Supervisor
- 8:30am: Meet with Library Director and AD Supervisor
- 9:00am: Break and meet with Admin. Assistant to prepare for presentation
- 9:30am: Presentation
  - Topic: What is the place of a Design/Planning Library in the 21st century: what challenges would an engaged librarian face in serving the needs of the architecture, landscape architecture and city planning disciplines?
- 10:15am: Break
- 10:30am: Meet with Search Committee members
- 11:30am: Lunch with colleague 1, colleague 2 and colleague 3
- 1:00pm: Meet with HR Director
- 1:15pm: Break
- 1:30pm: Meet with Committee on Appointment Promotion and Tenure & Committee on Faculty Benefits, Responsibilities and Research
- 2:00pm: Meet with Key Constituents including faculty and Subject Librarians
- 3:00pm: Meet with direct reports
- 3:30pm: Meet with AD Supervisor
- 4:30pm: Candidate leaves
During Each Interview

- Allow candidates to initiate physical greetings
- Provide an overview of expectations, agenda, and follow up
- Be aware of your body language and tone of voice
**After the Interviews**

- Immediately convene panel; discuss possibility of bias (include your own!)
- Gather and review rubrics from panelists; check for bias
- Conduct a “flip it to test it”
- Focus on knowledge and skills, not “fit”
- Use the interview as an independent data point